



Government of India  
National Commission for Scheduled Tribes

6<sup>th</sup> floor, 'B' Wing, Loknayak Bhawan  
Khan Market, New Delhi-110 003.

File No. DVD/11/2014/MRLY1/SEHRMT/RU-I

Date: 19/05/2015

To

The Advisor (Staff),  
Ministry of Railways,  
Railway Board, Rail Bhawan, Rafi Marg,  
New Delhi.

**Sub:** Representation dated 07/11/2014 from Shri D.V. Deoghare, Dy. CPO(HRD), Central Railway, Mumbai CST, regarding denial for implementation of reservation policy by Central Railway Administration.

Sir,

I am directed to enclose a copy of the minutes of the Proceedings of the Sitting held in the NCST on 29/04/2015 on the above mentioned subject for information and further necessary action.

Compliance Report may be submitted to the Commission by 18/06/2015.

Encl: As above

Yours faithfully,

  
(S.P. Meena)  
Assistant Director

Copy to:

Shri D.V. Deoghare,  
Dy. CPO(HRD), Central Railway,  
Mumbai CST,  
Mumbai – 400001.

Copy for information to:

1. PS to Hon'ble Chairperson, NCST
2. PS to Hon'ble Vice Chairperson, NCST
3. PPS to Joint Secretary, NCST
4. AD (Coord), NCST
- ✓ 5. SSA NIC (for hosting on Commission's website)



सत्यमेव जयते

**Govt. of India**  
**National Commission for Scheduled Tribes**

**File No. DVD/11/2014/MRLY1/SEHRMT/RU-I**

**Sub:** Minutes of the Sitting in the case of D.V. Deoghare, an employee of the Central Railway held under the Chairmanship of Hon'ble Vice Chairperson in the National Commission for Scheduled Tribes.

1. Sitting was held under the Chairmanship of Hon'ble Vice Chairperson, National Commission for Scheduled Tribes to discuss the case of Shri D.V. Deoghare, Sr. DPO/Pune, Central Railways in the Conference Room, National Commission for Scheduled Tribes at 4:30 PM on 29/04/2015.
2. The list of participants in the Sitting is given at Annexure A.
3. Initializing the discussion, the petitioner, Shri D.V. Deoghare expressed his grievance that in the selection held for the promotion to the post of APO (Group B) in 1992-93, he qualified the written test and was called for viva-voce. Thereafter, the Central Railway Administration issued the integrated seniority list of qualified candidates separately for UR, SC & ST candidates which is in violation of the Policy of the Railways. The seniority list should have been drawn based on the length of service in a particular grade. He further stated that another ST candidate namely Smt. S.V. Chordekar who was empanelled against the ST vacancy should have been adjusted against UR vacancy because she qualified the selection with general standards and the resulting ST vacancy should have been filled by the next candidate in the select list. This would have made him eligible for the promotion.
4. Officers from the Railways (the Railway Board and the Central Railway) stated that the concept of own merit in promotion was introduced w.e.f. 07/08/2002. Before this, the concept of "own merit" was applicable only in direct recruitments. Since the said selection was made in 1992-93, "own merit concept" is not applicable in the case of Shri D.V. Deoghare. Hence the argument of considering Smt. S.V. Chordekar against UR point is not tenable. They have clarified that in promotion to posts classified as selection posts, those SC/ST candidates who qualify with general standards should be empanelled first and only the deficiency in the reserved quota should be made good by those SC/ST candidates qualified with relaxed standards. Officers from the Railways stated that after declaring the result of that selection procedure, all the candidates were given time for their filing representation, if any. Only after examining all such representations, the final seniority list was published. They also stated that the selection took place more than 21 years ago and therefore the case has now become time barred. All the records pertaining to the selection have since been destroyed as per their policy on Record Retention Schedule.
5. After hearing both the parties, the Hon'ble Vice Chairperson, NCST advised the Railways to again review the case of Shri D.V. Deoghare who belongs to ST community sympathetically and action taken may be intimated to the Commission.
6. The Sitting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

*Ravi Thakur*

19-5-2015  
रवि ठाकुर/RAVI THAKUR  
उपाध्यक्ष/Vice Chairperson  
राष्ट्रीय अनुसूचित जनजाति आयोग  
National Commission for Scheduled Tribes  
भारत सरकार/Govt. of India  
नई दिल्ली/New Delhi

**National Commission for Scheduled Tribes**

File No. DVD/11/2014/MRLY1/SEHRMT/RU-I

Date:

**Sub:** Sitting held on 29/04/2015 at 4:30 P.M. in the case of Shri D.V. Deoghare, regarding denial for implementation of reservation policy by Central Railway Administration.

**Attendance Sheet**

**Sr. No. Name and Designation**

**I National Commission for Scheduled Tribes**

1. Shri Ravi Thakur  
Hon'ble Vice-Chairperson
2. Shri Mohan Das  
PS to Hon'ble Vice Chairperson
3. Shri Pramod Chand  
Deputy Secretary
4. Smt. S. Parthasarathy  
Consultant RU-I

**II Ministry of Railways**

1. Shri M. Akhtar  
A. M. (Staff)
2. A. Brahmo  
CPO/CR
3. K. Mal  
EDE (Res.)
4. P.C. Verma  
J.D. Estt. (Res.)

**III Petitioner**

1. Shri D.V. Deoghare  
Sr. DPO (PA)